# CITY OF SAN DIEGO HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF SEPTEMBER 23, 2010 202 C STREET, CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM, 12<sup>th</sup> FLOOR SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

### CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chair Lemmo at 1:06PM

Chairperson	John Lemmo	Present
Vice Chairperson	Abel Silvas	Absent
Boardmember	Michael Baksh	Present
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Alex Bethke	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Absent
Boardmember	Gail Garbini	Absent
Boardmember	Ann Jarmusch	Present
Boardmember	Linda Marrone	Present
Boardmember	Ann Woods	Present

Staff to the Board in Attendance: Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary

Cathy Winterrowd, Principal Planner

Kelley Stanco, Senior Planner Jeff Oakley, Associate Planner Jeff Dalglish, Planning Intern Terra King, Planning Intern

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Keith Bauerle, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES FOR July 22, 2010 and August 26, 2010

Not available at this time

### **ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT**

Myra Herrmann – October is California Archaeology Month

Historical Resources Board Minutes of September 23, 2010 Page 2 of 5

### **ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS**

### A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

### ABSENCES

Vice-Chair Silvas and Boardmembers Garbini and Curry notified staff they were unable to attend the hearing.

### OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION

✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

### • GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS

Boardmember Berge informed the Board that the 7<sup>th</sup> update for the Municipal Code will include a new process for minor construction on designated resources

### **B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS**

• CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

None

• EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS

None

• FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS /PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER

None

### C. STAFF REPORT

- CPF Workshop: Sustainability Myths; Thur Sept 30<sup>th</sup> in Balboa Park co-sponsored by City, SOHO, NHPC, SDAF and Calif Center for Sustainable Energy. Workshop will feature speakers who will discuss and demonstrate truly sustainable solutions for older windows, doors and exterior cladding, including weatherization and insulation for both noise and climate. The cost is \$60 for members and \$75 for non-members for half day workshop. The HRB and staff will be attending. More information at <a href="https://www.californiapreservation.org">www.californiapreservation.org</a>.
- The next DAS meeting is scheduled for October 6, 2010. The next Policy Subcommittee will be on Monday, October 11, 2010. The next Archaeology Subcommittee meeting will be on Monday, October 11, 2010.
- Boardmembers will note today's agenda includes two referrals from CCDC and four individual homeowner nominations, including 1 continued item from previous agendas. There are 19 individual homeowner nominations submitted in 2008, 21 homeowner nominations in 2009, and 18 homeowner nominations in 2010 that have not been reviewed by staff and brought forward for designation.

### D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

Bruce Coons (SOHO) asked for a continuance for Item 9 due to the limited amount of Boardmembers present and inadequate amount of time for SOHO to fully prepare a response to the Staff report.

Historical Resources Board Minutes of September 23, 2010 Page 3 of 5

Chair Lemmo does not support continuing an item because there are not enough Boardmembers present when there is a quorum present and they are ready to move forward.

### **BOARD ACTION:**

### MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO GRANT A CONTINUANCE TO THE OCTOBER 2010 MEETING FOR ITEM 9 – 1451-1453 F STREET

Seconded by Boardmember Jarmusch

Vote: 4-3-0

**Motion Passes** 

(Lemmo, Woods, Bethke)

### ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 6 – J.W. HARLAN/CARL AND MATILDA HAYS SPEC HOUSE #1 at 4165 Rochester Road

ITEM 7 – DR. JAMES AND LEONA PARKER HOUSE at 4637 Marlborough Drive

ITEM 8 – GLENN A. AND RUTH RICK HOUSE at 1439 Brookes Avenue

ITEM 10 – MATTIE BEARNS HOUSE at 1455 F Street

#### **BOARD ACTION:**

### MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEMS 6, 7, 8, AND 10 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION WITH MODIFICATIONS

Seconded by Boardmember Marrone Vote: 7-0-0 Motion Passes

### **ACTION ITEMS**

### ITEM 5 – ROBERT AND FRANCES JOHNSTON RENTAL HOUSE

### **Continued from July 2010**

Applicant: Dylan Calsyn & Beth Timpe represented by IS Architecture

Location: 1545 29th Street, 92102, Greater Golden Hill Community, Council District 3 (1289 2-E)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1545 29th Street as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the Robert and Frances Johnston Rental House located at 1545 29<sup>th</sup> Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1943-1948 under HRB Criterion A.

Report Number: HRB-10-048

### Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

### **Testimony Received:**

In Favor: Dylan Calsyn, Beth Timpe, Ione Steigler

In Opposition: None

### **Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Berge is struggling with this under Criterion A; she would like to know about the other properties that were owned by the Johnstons

Boardmember Bethke also has an issue with Criterion A, feels that it is a misapplication of the criteria and that its association with Hollywood Theatre is not significant.

Historical Resources Board Minutes of September 23, 2010 Page 4 of 5

Boardmember Jarmusch agrees with Boardmember Bethke, association is too tangential and limited. She does not support designation.

Chair Lemmo thinks there needs to be stronger evidence of association to support designation

Board member Marrone feels that there is sufficient evidence to support Staff's recommendation

Boardmember Baksh agrees with Boardmember Marrone and also supports Staff's recommendation

Boardmember Woods finds that the association between this home and the Hollywood Theater to be tenuous and problematic

Applicant requested a 60-day continuance to address the association and cultural development of San Diego

### **BOARD ACTION:**

## MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO GRANT A CONTINUANCE FOR ITEM 5 – ROBERT AND FRANCES JOHNSTON RENTAL HOUSE UNTIL THE NOVEMBER 2010 FOR THE APPLICANT TO PRESENT ADDITIONAL INFORMATION

Seconded by Boardmember Baksh Vote: 7-0-0 Motion Passes

ITEM CONTINUED UNTIL THE NOVEMBER 2010 HEARING AT THE REQUEST OF THE APPLICANT

### ITEM 6 – J.W. HARLAN/CARL AND MATILDA HAYS SPEC HOUSE #1

Applicant: Ben Marcantonio & Gary Pongratz represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 4165 Rochester Road, 92116, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 3 (1269 2-H)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 4165 Rochester Road as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the J.W. Harlan and Carl and Matilda Hays Spec House #1 located at 4165 Rochester Road as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1928 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the modified garage and the 1998 addition.

Report Number: HRB-10-042

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

### ITEM 7 – DR. JAMES AND LEONA PARKER HOUSE

Applicant: Christopher and Dana Bessenecker

Location: 4637 Marlborough Drive, 92116, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 3 (1269 3-H)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 4637 Marlborough Drive as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the Dr. James and Leona Parker House under HRB Criterion C as an example of the Mission Revival style architecture retaining integrity from its 1924 period of significance.

Report Number: HRB-10-044

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT WITH CORRECTIONS TO THE RESOLUTION TO ADD THE PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE AND A STATEMENT OF INTEGRITY

Historical Resources Board Minutes of September 23, 2010 Page 5 of 5

### ITEM 8 – GLENN A. AND RUTH RICK HOUSE

Applicant: Mary Donnelly Trust represented by Happy Hazard LLC

Location: 1439 Brookes Avenue, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (1269 6-B)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 1439 Brookes Avenue as a historical resource. Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not

designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Glenn A and Ruth Rick House located at 1439 Brookes Avenue as a

historical resource with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-10-045

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT WITH CORRECTIONS TO THE RESOLUTION TO ADD THE PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE AND A STATEMENT OF INTEGRITY AND TO ADD THE NAME OF THE BUILDER AND DESIGNER TO THE REGISTER

### ITEM 9 - 1451-1453 F STREET

Applicant: Ponce Living Trust represented by Marie Burke Lia

<u>Location</u>: 1451-1453 F Street, 92101, Centre City Community, Council District 2 (1289 3-B)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 1451-1453 F Street as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 1451-1453 F Street under any HRB Criteria.

Report Number: HRB-10-046

ITEM CONTINUED TO THE OCTOBER 2010 MEETING AT THE REQUEST OF SOHO

### ITEM 10 – MATTIE BEARNS HOUSE

Applicant: Kenneth P. Bourke represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 1455 F Street, 92101, Centre City Community, Council District 2 (1289 3-B)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 1455 F Street as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Mattie Bearns House located at 1455 F Street Avenue as a historical

resource with a period of significance of circa 1909 under HRB Criterion C

Report Number: HRB-10-047

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

**REMINDER:** 

**NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE**: October 28, 2010

**LOCATION**: City Administration Building

12<sup>th</sup> Floor, Council Committee Room

**MEETING ADJOURNED AT 1:55PM**